

**PROGRAM PAGES FOR  
CONCERT NIGHT  
ON  
DISCOVER CLASSICAL  
SUNDAY, MAY 5, 8-10PM**

Concert Program Pages from  
MS-314, Dayton Philharmonic  
Orchestra Records at Wright  
State University Libraries'  
Special Collections  
and Archives.  
Thanks to Lisa Rickey!

INSPIRE THE IMAGINATION  
2000-2001 Season



DAYTON  
PHILHARMONIC  
ORCHESTRA

NEAL GITLEMAN, MUSIC DIRECTOR

# DAYTON PHILHARMONIC ORCHESTRA PERSONNEL

68th Season - 2000-2001

Neal Gittleman, Music Director

Paul Katz, Founding Music Director

## 1st Violins

Kirstin Greenlaw,  
*Acting Concertmaster*  
J. Ralph Corbett Chair  
Aurelian Oprea,  
*Acting Assistant Concertmaster*  
Marilyn Fischer,  
Huffy Foundation Chair  
Elizabeth Hofeldt  
Sherman Standard Register  
Foundation Chair  
Karlton Taylor  
Mikhail Baranovsky  
Louis Proske  
Nancy Mullins  
Barry Berndt  
Philip Enzweiler  
Leora Kline  
Janet George  
Gong-Qian Yang

## 2nd Violins

Kristen Dykema,  
*Acting Principal*  
Jesse Philips Chair  
Ann Lin,  
*Acting Assistant Principal*  
Eun-ho Kim  
Gloria Fiore  
David Fielder  
Mary Arnett  
Stephanie Kime  
Lynn Rohr  
Warren Driver  
William Slusser  
Joyce Green  
Yoshiko Kunimitsu

## Violas

Sheridan Kamberger, *Principal*  
F. Dean Schnacke Chair  
Colleen Braid,  
*Assistant Principal*  
Karen Johnson  
Grace Counts Finch Chair  
Jean Blasingame  
Belinda Burge  
Lori Wittenmyer  
Mark Reis  
Emma Louise Odum,  
*Principal Emeritus*

## Cellos

Linda Katz, *Principal*  
Edward L. Kohnle Chair

Xiao-Fan Zhang,  
*Assistant Principal*  
Karl and Caroline Lorenz  
Memorial Chair  
Jane Katsuyama  
Nan Watson  
Catherine McClintock  
Mark Hofeldt  
Mary Davis  
Nadine Monchecourt  
Christina Coletta\*

## Basses

Deborah Taylor, *Principal*  
Dayton Philharmonic  
Volunteer Association  
C. David Horine Memorial  
Chair  
Jon Pascolini,  
*Assistant Principal*  
Donald Compton  
Steven Ullery  
Christopher Roberts  
James Faulkner  
Bleda Elibal  
Nick Greenberg

## Flutes

Rebecca Tryon Andres,  
*Principal*  
Dayton Philharmonic  
Volunteer Association Chair  
Jennifer Northcut  
Janet van Graas

## Oboes

Roger Miller, *Principal*  
Catharine French Bieser Chair  
Gregory Dickinson  
Christopher Philpotts\*

## Clarinets

John Kurokawa, *Principal*  
Rhea Beerman Peal Chair  
Robert Gray  
Anthony Costa

## Bassoons

Jennifer Kelley Speck, *Principal*  
Robert and Elaine Stein Chair  
Kristen Canova\*  
Bonnie Sherman

## French Horns

Richard Chenoweth, *Principal*  
Frank M. Tait Memorial Chair

Carlos Castrillon  
Todd Fitter  
Sarah Greene  
Nancy Cahall, *Utility*

## Trumpets

Charles Pagnard, *Principal*  
John W. Berry Family Chair  
Alan Siebert  
Michael Kane

## Trombones

Timothy Anderson, *Principal*  
John Reger Memorial Chair  
Clair Miller  
Chad Arnow

## Tuba

Steven Winteregg, *Principal*  
Zachary, Rachel and Natalie  
Denka Chair

## Timpani

Donald Donnett, *Principal*  
Rosenthal Family Chair in  
Memory of Miriam Rosenthal

## Percussion

Jane Varella, *Principal*  
Miriam Rosenthal Chair  
Mark Libby\*  
Richard A. and Mary T.  
Whitney Chair  
Chris Carmean  
William Awsumb

## Keyboard

Michael Chertock, *Principal*  
Demirjian Family Chair

## Harp

Leslie Stratton Norris, *Principal*  
Daisy Talbott Greene Chair

Jane Varella, *Personnel Manager*

William Slusser,  
*Orchestra Librarian*  
Hank Dahlman, *Chorus Director*  
Patrick Reynolds, *Orchestra Cover  
Conductor, Concert Band and Youth  
Orchestra Conductor*  
Karen Young,  
*Junior String Orchestra Director*

\*Leave of Absence

# NEAL'S NOTES

## Mademoiselle

The composer Virgil Thompson once said "Every American town has two things: a five-and-dime and a student of Nadia Boulanger." At the time, he was right. He's still half-right, now that the five-and-dimes have disappeared. And I know for sure that he's half-right about Dayton, because I'm a student of Mlle. Boulanger (and I'm sure there are others in town, too.)

I'm thinking of "Mademoiselle" (as all her students called her) right now because of our upcoming performances with pianist Emile Naoumoff, who joins the Dayton Philharmonic Orchestra in May to play Mozart's Piano Concerto No.23 on our Coffee/Casual Series at the Victoria Theatre and Tchaikovsky's Piano Concerto No.1 on our final classical concerts of the season at Memorial Hall. (Emile will also give a recital at the DPVA's Designer Showhouse, so we're certainly keeping him busy.)

I first met Emile in June of 1974, when I arrived at Fontainebleau, France to begin my studies with Nadia Boulanger. I didn't quite know what to expect. But I certainly could never have expected Emile. He was, in a word, amazing. He had perfect pitch and a seemingly perfect musical memory. He could play anything. He was a pretty decent composer. The most complicated dictations and exercises—the ones that tied all the other students up in knots—were child's play for Emile...

...literally child's play. He was only 9 years old! I was ten years older, and somehow, from the very first time "the little Emilka" came up to me wearing sandals, red shorts, a bolo tie, cowboy hat and badge, grabbed me by the wrist and announced that I had been placed under arrest by "le shérif de Fontainebleau," we became fast friends!

During the time that I studied with Mademoiselle, Emile and I saw each other constantly. We were in all the same classes, went to many of the same concerts, even got together to play soccer in Paris' Bois de Boulogne park. Since I left France in 1977 Emile and I have kept in touch, but we haven't laid eyes on each other in almost 25 years. His May visit will fix that!

But as Arlo Guthrie said in "Alice's Restaurant," that's not what I came here to tell you

about. I came here to tell you about Nadia Boulanger.

I've worked with many great musicians and had many great teachers, but there was no one like Mademoiselle. And no one had more influence on who I am as a person and as a musician. There's a picture of Nadia Boulanger over my desk. She appears, periodically, in my dreams. And, more importantly, there's her voice in the back of my head—all the time.

Here's a for-instance... By now, DPO musicians have gotten accustomed to it, but I used to get incredibly confused looks from them when I asked them to "give more accent on the upbeat than on the downbeat." After all, that's one of the first things we learn in music: you put the accent on the downbeat. (In a bar of four-four time, you count "ONE-two-three-four, ONE-two-three-four.") But Mademoiselle believed that led to rhythmically dull, leaden performances. For her, the key to lively rhythm and expressive phrasing was to accent the downbeat a little but the upbeat more: "ONE-two-three-FOUR, ONE-two-three-FOUR." Sounds crazy, but it works. And for me it works every single day, in every single piece of music I encounter.

Then there's the issue of high standards. Mademoiselle's standards were the highest. It didn't matter what you were doing—playing a complicated score from sight at the piano, accompanying a flutist or playing a four-part harmony exercise—if you didn't do your best, if you didn't play as beautifully as you could, if you didn't play the tenor voice with your left hand, it wasn't good enough. And if it wasn't good enough, you just did it again until it was. Mademoiselle led by example. No student worked harder at their lessons than she worked at her teaching. I mostly studied harmony with her, but I learned much, much more: integrity, perseverance, humility, dedication, commitment.

Mademoiselle was a mentor who changed her students' lives. Thousands of people passed through her studio, and one way or another, she touched each and every one of them. Emile Naoumoff and I were fortunate enough to be around in the final years of her life. I thank my lucky stars every day that I had the chance to study with her, and I'm sure Emile does, too.

## EMILE NAOUMOFF

Born in 1962 in Sofia, Bulgaria, Emile Naoumoff began studying piano at age five. At age 19 he was appointed professor at the American Conservatory in Paris and subsequently taught at the Conservatory of Paris.

Naoumoff has made appearances in the major cities of Europe, United States, Japan, and Israel collaborating with esteemed artists such as Leonard Bernstein, Igor Stravinsky, Aram Khachaturian, Clifford Curzon, Jean Françaix, and Henri Dutilleux. He has played with some of the world's finest orchestras including the Orchestra of the Residence of The Hague, Los Angeles Philharmonic, San Francisco Symphony, National Symphony of Washington, and the NHK Symphony in Tokyo.

Also recognized as a composer, Naoumoff studied composition between the ages of 8 and eighteen with Nadia Boulanger in Paris. The international publishing house, Schott à Mayence, publishes his compositions.



In 1991, Naoumoff toured South America with the National Orchestra of Bordeaux-Aquitaine under the direction of Alain Lombard, making appearances in Buenos Aires, Rio de Janeiro, São Paulo, Montevideo, and Santiago de Chile. He presented the world premiere of Moussorgsky's *Pictures at an Exhibition* in his own arrangement for piano and orchestra in 1994 at the Kennedy Center in Washington, D.C. with Rostropovich conducting.

Naoumoff received the medal of the city of Paris from the then mayor, Jacques Chirac. He was recently appointed Associate Professor of Piano at Indiana University, Bloomington, where he lives with his wife, professional bassoonist Catherine Marchese, and their two children, Vladimir and Nadia.

*Accommodations for the Dayton Philharmonic's guest artists and conductors are provided by DoubleTree Hotel and the Crowne Plaza Dayton.*

### DAYTON PHILHARMONIC ORCHESTRA

and

### FRAZE PAVILION

Present

#### SUNSET SYMPHONY SERIES - 2001 SEASON

##### **Burt Bacharach**

Saturday, June 23, 8:30 pm

##### **Celebrate America**

Saturday, July 7, 8:30 pm

##### **Magic of Mozart**

Saturday, July 21, 8:30 pm  
Clarinetist, John Kurokawa

##### **Smothers Brothers**

Saturday, August 4, 8:30 pm

##### **Bravo Broadway!**

Saturday, August 18, 8:30 p.m.

Randall Craig Fleicher, guest conductor

Jan Horvath, Michael Maguire, and Doug LaBrecque, soloists



**CLASSICAL CONCERT**  
**DAYTON PHILHARMONIC ORCHESTRA**  
Neal Gittleman, Music Director

**IN MEMORY OF SUSAN SEYFARTH**

**Wednesday, May 16, 2001 • Thursday, May 17, 2001**

**8:00 p.m.**  
**Memorial Hall**

**Emile Naoumoff, piano**

**Dayton Philharmonic Chorus**  
**Hank Dahlman, director**

**Sponsors:**  
**NCR – William S. Anderson Endowed Concert**  
**KeyBank**

**Media Sponsors: WDPR & WDPG**

Johannes Brahms  
(1833-1897)

*Nänie, Op.82*

Conducted by HANK DAHLMAN

Igor Stravinsky  
(1885-1975)

Symphony of Psalms

- I Psalm 39:13-14
- II Psalm 40:1-3
- III Psalm 150

INTERMISSION

Pyotr Ilyich Tchaikovsky  
(1840-1893)

Piano Concerto No.1 in B-flat minor, Op.23

*Allegro non troppo e molto maestoso—Allegro con  
spirito—Poco più lento  
Andantino semplice—Prestissimo  
Allegro con fuoco—Molto più mosso—Allegro vivo*

**EMILE NAOUMOFF**

This concert will be broadcast on WDPR-FM 88.1 and WDPG-FM 89.9 on  
Sunday, July 15, 2001, at 7.00 p.m. hosted by Lloyd Bryant.

# PROGRAM NOTES

By Dr. Richard Benedum



## Johannes Brahms

### *Nänie*

Johannes Brahms was born in Hamburg on May 7, 1833, and died in Vienna on April 3, 1897. He began *Nänie* (Song of Lamentation), Op. 82, in 1880 and completed it in Pressbaum, near Vienna, in 1881. The first performance was given in Zurich on December 6, 1881. This is the first performance by the Dayton Philharmonic Orchestra.

Brahms wrote *Nänie*, Op. 82, a setting of Friedrich Schiller's sonnet and his second-to-last work for chorus and orchestra, in memory of his friend, the painter Anselm Feuerbach (1829-1880). The score was dedicated to the painter's mother, Henriette.

The title of Schiller's poem comes from the

Auch das Schöne muss sterben!  
Das Menschen und Götter bezwingt,  
nicht die ehrene Brust  
rührt es des stygischen Zeus.  
Einmal nur erreichte die Liebe  
den Schattenbeherrscher,  
und an der Schwelle noch, streng,  
rief er zurück sein Geschenk.  
Nicht stillt Aphrodite  
dem schönen Knaben die Wunde,  
die in den zierlichen Leib grausam  
der Eber geritzt.  
Nicht erettet den göttlichen Held  
die unsterbliche Mutter,  
wenn er, am skäischen Tor fallend,  
sein Schicksal erfüllt.  
Aber sie steigt aus dem Meer  
mit allen Töchtern des Nereus,  
und die Klage hebt an  
um den verherrlichten Sohn.  
Siehe, da weinen die Götter,  
es weinen die Göttinnen alle,  
daß Schöne vergeht,  
daß Vollkommene stirbt.  
Auch ein Klaglied zu sein  
im Mund der Geliebten ist herrlich,  
denn das Gemeine  
geht klanglos zum Orkus hinab.

(Hades was the ruler of the Underworld; Orpheus was allowed to leave the Underworld with his wife Eurydice, but when he looked back at her before reaching the surface, he lost her forever. Adonis, loved by

2 Flutes, 2 Oboes,  
2 Clarinets,  
2 Bassoons, 2 Horns,  
3 Trombones, Timpani,  
Harp, and Strings

word "naenia," a Roman funeral song. The idea of setting Schiller's words probably occurred to Brahms after he had heard a setting by Hermann Götz at a concert by the Viennese Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde (Society of the Friends of Music) on February 14, 1880. Brahms's music matches the classical dignity of Schiller's poetry and of Feuerbach's paintings with music of ethereal beauty and restraint. Brahms's view of death,

both here and in his Requiem, holds no terror; for him, death is rather a benevolent spirit who brings rest to those weary of life.

*Nänie* is one of Brahms's least known major works, but one of his most exquisitely beautiful in its sense of repose and serenity.

Even Beauty must die!  
That which subdues men and gods  
does not move the steely heart  
of Stygian Zeus.  
Only once did love touch  
the ruler of the underworld  
and still upon the threshold, sternly,  
he recalled his gift.  
Aphrodite does not tend  
the lovely youth's wound,  
torn by the savage boar in  
his graceful body.  
The immortal mother does not save  
the godly hero when,  
dying at the Scaean gate,  
his destiny he fulfills.  
But she rises from the sea  
with all Nereus' daughters  
and the lament  
for the exalted son goes up.  
Behold, the gods weep,  
all the goddesses weep,  
that beauty must fade,  
that perfection must die.  
Even to be an elegy  
in the mouth of the beloved  
is glorious for the ordinary  
goes down unsung to Orcus.

Aphrodite, was killed in a boar hunt. Achilles, son of the sea-nymph Thetis, died at the hands of Paris before the gates of Troy; Nereus was the father of Thetis and the other sea-nymphs.)

## Igor Stravinsky

### *Symphony of Psalms*



Stravinsky was born in Oranienbaum, Russia on June 17, 1882, and died in New York on April 6, 1971. His *Symphony of Psalms* was commissioned to mark the 50th anniversary of the Boston Symphony Orchestra in 1930, but because of an unexpectedly postponed performance in Boston, Ernest Ansermet and the Brussels Philharmonic Society gave the premiere on December 13, 1930. Six days later Serge Koussevitsky gave the American premiere in Boston. This is the first performance by the Dayton Philharmonic Orchestra.

In his *Chronicles of My Life* Stravinsky wrote:

The idea of composing a symphonic work of considerable scope had occupied me for a long time. I therefore willingly accepted a proposition which coincided entirely with my inclinations. I was given full liberty in the form of the piece, as well as the forces that I might require for its performance... My work on the *Symphony of Psalms* began in the first part of the year [1930], and was frequently interrupted by a number of concerts in Europe, in which I took part at times as conductor, at times as pianist. My most recent work, the *Capriccio*, was having a considerable success in different cities.... At the beginning of the summer, I could at last give my whole time to my symphony, of which I had completed only one part. As for the two others [movements], I wrote them entirely—at first at Nice, then at Charavines, through which I was passing, at the edge of the little Lake Paladru [between Grenoble and Lyon]. On the 15th of August I put the last touches on the draft of the score and then was able to work at ease on the orchestration, which had already begun at Nice.

Although the *Symphony of Psalms* was written on a commission, it reflects religious feelings that were important to Stravinsky

5 Flutes, 5 Oboes,  
4 Bassoons, 4 Horns,  
5 Trumpets,  
3 Trombones, Tuba,  
Timpani, Percussion,  
Harp, 2 Pianos,  
Cellos, and Basses

for most of his life. He wrote in French on the title page: "This *Symphony* is composed to the glory of GOD and is dedicated to the Boston Symphony on the occasion of its 50th anniversary." Stravinsky had been raised in the Russian Orthodox Church but,

sharply critical of its rites and ceremonies, left it as a young man. In 1926 he returned to the Church, however, and immediately composed a short *Pater Noster* as the first act of his revitalized faith. He continued to compose sacred works throughout the rest of his life: *Mass*, *Canticum Sacrum*, and *Threni*, in addition to *Symphony of Psalms*.

Stravinsky wrote the following commentary for his *Symphony*:

According to my plan, my symphony was to be a work with substantial contrapuntal development and for that I felt the need to enlarge the means at my disposal. I finally arrived at a choral and instrumental ensemble in which these two elements would be granted equal rank without any predominance of one over the other. In this respect, my point of view on the mutual relations of the vocal and instrumental parts coincided with that of the old masters of contrapuntal music who also treated them as equals and who neither reduced the role of the chorus to a homophonic chant nor the function of the instrumental ensemble to that of an accompaniment.

As to the words, I sought them among texts specifically created to be sung. And quite naturally, the first idea that came to mind was to have recourse to the *Psalter*...

*Continued on page 38*



Continued from page 35

Although the Symphony may have reflected, to some degree, his personal religious feelings, Stravinsky deliberately avoided sentimental emotionalism. He omitted the sensuous sound of the upper strings and the lyrical clarinet and used the percussive—not melodic—qualities of the piano, giving the overall orchestration a dark, burnished sound. He chose to set the text in the traditional but neutral Latin of the Vulgate edition rather than use a modern language. The vocal writing is for chorus alone without the “personal” voices of soloists. And Stravinsky specified that boys should sing the treble parts (although his own performances and his recording used women). His melodic lines, especially in the first movement, are reminiscent of Gregorian chant:



or, as in the second movement, he writes a fugue (actually a double fugue—he called

them an “instrumental fugue” and a “human fugue,” and combined them at the end of the movement), the most intellectually rigorous of musical forms. Even so, Stravinsky allowed that portions of the Symphony were inspired by a personal religious vision. “The *allegro* of the third movement was inspired by a vision of Elijah’s chariot climbing to the heavens,” he admitted, while the slow section of that movement was “a prayer to the Russian image of the infant Christ with orb and scepter;” and “The final hymn must be thought of as issuing from the skies, and agitation is followed by ‘the calm of praise’...” Because he felt that “Rhythm and motion, not the element of feeling, are the foundation of musical art,” however, he added that “such statements [about the inspiration for portions of Symphony of Psalms] embarrass me.”

Joseph Maclis, a prolific writer about music in the twentieth century, wrote about this magnificent work, “For sheer grandeur of conception, there is little in the output of the first half of our century to rival the Symphony of Psalms.”

---

## I

Exaudi orationem mean, Domine,  
et deprecationem meam.  
Auribus percipe lacrimas meas.

Ne sileas, quoniam advena ego sum  
apud te  
et peregrinus, sicut omnes patres mei.

Remite mihi, ut refrigerer  
Priusquam abeam et amplius  
non ero.

Hear my prayer, Lord,  
and my pleading.  
Let thy ears perceive my tears.

Do not remain silent, for a stranger  
am I to you  
and a pilgrim, like all my fathers.

Forgive me, that I may be refreshed  
Before I go away, and am  
no more.

Psalm 39:13-14

## II

Expectans expectavi Dominum,  
Et intendi mihi  
et exaudivit preces meas;

Et eduxit me de lacu miseriae,  
et de luto faecis.

Et statuit super petram pedes meos:  
et direxit gressus meos.

I waited expectantly upon the Lord,  
And he reached out to me,  
And he heard my prayers;

And he led me out of the lake of misery,  
and out of the dregs of mud.

And he set my feet upon rock,  
and directed my steps.

Et immisit in os meum canticum novum,  
carmen Deo nostro.

Videbunt multi et timebunt,  
et sperabunt in Domino.

And he has put in my mouth a new song,  
a hymn to our God.

Many will see and will fear,  
and will hope in the Lord.

Psalm 40:1-3

Alleluia.

Laudate Dominum in sanctis ejus.  
Laudate eum in firmamento virtutis ejus.  
Laudate eum in virtutibus ejus.  
Laudate eum secundum multitudinem  
magnitudinis ejus.  
Laudate eum in sono tubae.  
Laudate eum in timpano et choro.  
Laudate eum in cordis et organo.  
Laudate eum in cymbalis resonantibus.  
Laudate eum in cymbalis jubilationibus.  
Omnis spritus laudet Dominum.

### III

Alleluia.

Praise the Lord in his sanctuary.  
Praise him in the mightiness of his power.  
Praise him for his great powers.  
Praise him according to the multitude  
of his magnitudes.  
Praise him with the sound of trumpets.  
Praise him with drums and with dance.  
Praise him with strings and with pipes.  
Praise him with resounding cymbals.  
Praise him with cymbals of jubilation.  
All that hath breath, praise the Lord.

Psalm 150

Translation by Nick Jones

We can help you get  
control of your entire  
financial picture.



Key PrivateBank can help put the reins of financial control firmly in your hands. With our comprehensive perspective and the added capabilities of McDonald Investments, A KeyCorp Company, we offer complete and tailored investment management, financing and investment banking solutions. To learn more call Steve Heyl at 586-8061.



©1999 KeyCorp



PrivateBank

# Pyotr Ilyich Tchaikovsky

## Piano Concerto No. 1



Tchaikovsky was born in Kamsko-Votinsk in the district of Viatka on May 7, 1840; he died on November 6, 1893, St. Petersburg. His Piano Concerto No.1 in B-Flat Minor, Op. 23, was written during 1874-1875, and was premiered by Liszt's son-in-law, Hans von Bülow, on October 25, 1875, Boston. The work was most recently performed by the Dayton Philharmonic on October 9, 1996 with soloist Awadagin Pratt and guest conductor George Manahan.

*2 flutes, 2 oboes,  
2 clarinets, 2 bassoons,  
4 French horns,  
2 trumpets,  
3 trombones, timpani,  
strings and solo piano*

Why was the premiere of this well-known concerto in Boston, and not in Moscow or St. Petersburg? The story behind this surprising development would easily provide enough intrigue for a tempestuous Russian novel. Tchaikovsky, after finishing work on the piece, wanted to show it to Anton Rubinstein's younger brother Nikolai, to whom the work was originally dedicated.

Not being a pianist, I considered it necessary to consult a virtuoso as to any point in my concerto which might be technically impracticable, ungrateful, or ineffective. I had need of a severe critic, but at the same time of one friendly disposed towards me. Without going into trivialities, I must admit that an inner voice protested against my selection of Rubinstein to judge the mechanical part of my work. However, he was not only the best pianist in Moscow, but undeniably a musician of great distinction, and I felt sure that he would take offence if he should learn that I had passed him over and shown the concerto to another pianist. Therefore I decided to ask him to hear the Concerto and make his observations concerning the solo part.

So the meeting took place, with Nikolai Rubinstein, who was originally to have premiered the piece, more than fulfilling Tchaikovsky's worst premonitions. If Tchaikovsky had lived during the Russian

Revolution, he might well have felt that it was less stormy than the confrontation with Rubinstein! He continued his description:

"Well?" said I, as I arose. Then sprang forth a vigorous stream of words from Rubinstein's mouth. At first, he spoke quietly, but by degrees his passion rose, and finally he resembled Zeus hurling thunderbolts. It appeared that my Concerto was worthless and absolutely unplayable, that the passages were manufactured and withal so clumsy as to be beyond correction, that the composition itself was bad, trivial and commonplace, that I had stolen this point from somebody and that one from somebody else, that only two or three pages had any value, and all the rest should be either destroyed or entirely remodelled. "For example, that! What is that, really?" (and the offending passage would be caricatured at the piano), "and that? How is it possible?" etc. etc. I cannot reproduce, what was worst, the accent and the voice with which Nikolai Gregorievich [Rubinstein] said all this. In short, an unbiased spectator of the scene could have only thought that I was a stupid, untalented and conceited spoiler of music paper, who had the impertinence to show his rubbish to a celebrated man...

Tchaikovsky changed nothing, withdrew the dedication and gave it instead to Hans von Bülow, an artist he knew to be interested in his work, although the two had never met. The German was on the verge of departing for an American tour, took the Concerto with him, and thus the Boston premiere.

The proper Boston critics were not overly appreciative of the work, but after Rubinstein's harsh invective Tchaikovsky took the mild Bostonian rebuke almost as a compliment. Since then, it quickly gained an established place in the repertoire; it has long since enjoyed a reputation as one of the "kings" of the concerto literature.